

DOE/NASA/2593-79/9
NASA TM-79272

NASA-TM-79272 19800005001



REACTIONS OF CALCIUM ORTHOSILICATE AND BARIUM ZIRCONATE WITH OXIDES AND SULFATES OF VARIOUS ELEMENTS

Isidor Zaplatynsky
National Aeronautics and Space Administration
Lewis Research Center

October 1979

110 2500

1000 2500

LEWIS RESEARCH CENTER
LICKING FIELD STATION
COLUMBUS, OHIO 43208



Prepared for
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY
Energy Technology
Fossil Fuel Utilization Division

NOTICE

This report was prepared to document work sponsored by the United States Government. Neither the United States nor its agent, the United States Department of Energy, nor any Federal employees, nor any of their contractors, subcontractors or their employees, makes any warranty, express or implied, or assumes any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness, or usefulness of any information, apparatus, product or process disclosed, or represents that its use would not infringe privately owned rights.

DOE/NASA/2593-79/9
NASA TM-79272

REACTION OF CALCIUM
ORTHOSILICATE AND
BARIUM ZIRCONATE WITH
OXIDES AND SULFATES
OF VARIOUS ELEMENTS

Isidor Zaplatynsky
National Aeronautics and Space Administration
Lewis Research Center
Cleveland, Ohio 44135

October 1979

Work performed for
U. S. DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY
Energy Technology
Fossil Fuel Utilization Division
Washington, D.C. 20545
Under Interagency Agreement EF-77-A-01-2593

N80-13257 #
~~NASA-79272~~

SUMMARY

Calcium orthosilicate and barium zirconate are being evaluated as the insulating layer of thermal barrier coatings for air-cooled gas turbine components. Surface temperatures of such coatings might reach 1300°-1400° C in hot spot locations. Thus chemical stability of these compounds was studied at 1100° and 1300° C in the presence of some oxides and sulfates for times to 400 and 200 hours respectively. The oxides and sulfates studied represent some of the oxidation products of impurities found in either the combustion air, or the fuels as well as the elements in the bond coat alloys. These compounds are listed below in four groups, according to their reactivity with calcium orthosilicate (actual composition was 1.78 CaO·SiO₂) and barium zirconate.

Compounds that reacted with 2 CaO·SiO₂ : Na₂O, BaO, MgO, CoO, Al₂O₃, Cr₂O₃, SiO₂*, P₂O₅ and V₂O₅.

Compounds that did not react with 2CaO·SiO₂ : Na₂SO₄, K₂O, K₂SO₄, BaSO₄, NiO, ZnO and Fe₂O₃.

Compounds that reacted with BaZrO₃: Al₂O₃, Cr₂O₃, Fe₂O₃, SiO₂, P₂O₅ and V₂O₅.

Compounds that did not react with BaZrO₃: Na₂O, Na₂SO₄, K₂O, K₂SO₄, MgO, CaO, CoO and ZnO.

When comparing these results with data available for reactions between similar compounds and ZrO₂-8w/oY₂O₃ it can be noted that all three materials reacted with SiO₂, P₂O₅ and V₂O₅. Also, zirconia was susceptible to attack by alkali and alkaline earth metal oxides. Calcium orthosilicate and barium zirconate were not susceptible to such attack but reacted readily with Al₂O₃ and Cr₂O₃ which did not react with ZrO₂-8w/oY₂O₃.

INTRODUCTION

The yttria-stabilized zirconia thermal barrier coating (TBC) developed at the NASA Lewis Research Center (refs. 1 and 2) has shown significant improvement in adherence and spall resistance over earlier efforts in this area (refs. 3 to 6). However, it has been found that yttria-stabilized zirconia is susceptible to attack by a number of compounds that might exist as impurities in turbine combustion gases (ref. 7). This might not be a problem in the case of aircraft

*The reaction of SiO₂ with 2CaO·SiO₂ was not studied in these experiments, but based on reference 11 a reaction would be expected to occur.

gas turbines, since they burn high purity kerosenes. However, even here one could expect some difficulties if such zirconia thermal barriers were used in a salt air (marine) environment. In non-aircraft gas turbines, burning dirtier fuels such as crude or residual fuel oils and possibly future synthetic fuels, the potential problems would be expected to be much worse. Indeed, very short lives were observed in burner rig tests of $\text{ZrO}_2\text{-12w/oY}_2\text{O}_3/\text{NiCrAlY}$ thermal barriers exposed to combustion gases doped with 5 ppm Na and 2 ppm V (ref. 8). Analysis of these tests indicated that the worst condition occurred when the impurity condensed as a liquid (ref. 9). In the search for alternate coatings with improved resistance to corrosion, calcium orthosilicate and barium zirconate are being tested as potential materials for thermal barrier coatings. The former material has already been shown to offer a significant improvement over zirconia in resistance to sodium and vanadium-doped combustion gases (ref. 8). The present investigation supports this quest for improved coatings. Its specific purpose was to use laboratory tests to provide insight into the chemical stability of calcium orthosilicate and barium zirconate in the presence of potential fuel, air and bond coat derived impurities. The experiments were performed in furnaces at 1100° and 1300° C for times to 400 and 200 hours, respectively. The test temperatures reflect hot spot conditions for TBC coated components in current industrial gas turbines and TBC surface temperatures expected on larger areas in advanced gas turbines. As in the study of $\text{ZrO}_2\text{-8w/oY}_2\text{O}_3$ (Ref. 7), the phase compositions of the reaction products were determined by X-ray diffraction (XRD) analysis.

EXPERIMENTAL PROCEDURE

MATERIALS

The calcium orthosilicate used in this investigation was in the form of commercially available plasma spray powder ($-200 +325$ mesh). While the chemical analysis indicated that the calcium and silicon content in the material corresponded to a $1.78 \text{ CaO} \cdot \text{SiO}_2$ composition, the XRD pattern taken with $\text{Cu K}\alpha$ radiation revealed that this silicate was primarily a monoclinic form, called larnite or $\beta\text{-Ca}_2\text{SiO}_4$ (ref. 10). Some of the diffraction lines, due to the closeness of their spacings, were not resolved but recorded as one. For example the strong lines (200) and (022) or (013), (103) and (121) were observed as one diffraction line. Spectrographic analysis revealed the presence of the following impurities in weight percent or PPM (parts per million): 0.8% Al, 5 PPM Co, 60PPM Cr, 100 PPM Cu, 410 PPM Fe, 0.2% Mg, 20 PPM Mn, 40 PPM Mo, 90 PPM Ni, 320 PPM Ti and 120 PPM Zr. Barium zirconate (BaZrO_3) was prepared by mixing high purity monoclinic ZrO_2 (particle size 1-5 microns) with reagent grade BaCO_3 powder and reacting the mixture for 100 hours at 1300°C in a platinum dish. These conditions were sufficient to complete the synthesis of BaZrO_3 . The completion of the reaction was verified by XRD. All the diffraction lines were accounted for as belonging to BaZrO_3 (perovskite structure) except one weak line ($d = 3.048\text{\AA}$), which could not be identified.

The following reagent grade compounds, representing impurities in the fuels and in the combustion air as well as the elements of the bond coat alloy were reacted with $2\text{CaO} \cdot \text{SiO}_2$ and BaZrO_3 : Na_2O , Na_2SO_4 , K_2O , K_2SO_4 , CaO , BaO , BaSO_4 , NiO , CoO , MgO , ZnO , Fe_2O_3 , Al_2O_3 , Cr_2O_3 , SiO_2 ,

V_2O_5 and P_2O_5 . For practical reasons Na_2O , K_2O , CaO , BaO and CoO were introduced in the form of their carbonates. Also $(NH_4)_2HPO_4$ was substituted for P_2O_5 to facilitate handling.

Preparation of the Specimens

Binary powder mixtures of $2CaO \cdot SiO_2$ or $BaZrO_3$ with the above listed compounds were prepared by thoroughly mixing, in a mortar, 1 gram of $2CaO \cdot SiO_2$ or $BaZrO_3$ with an "equivalent" amount of the compound. The "equivalent" amounts were calculated in the manner that for each atom of Ca or Ba there would be an atom of an element such as Na, Ni, Fe, etc. All mixtures were packed in small cylindrical containers made of 0.6 cm diameter platinum tubing with one end welded shut. After filling with the powder mixtures, the other end of each tube was pinched tightly.

Heat Treatment and XRD Analysis

One set of samples so prepared was heated at $1100^\circ C$ for 200 hours, after which time a small amount of material was removed from each container for XRD analysis. The remainder of each sample in the set was heated at the same temperature for an additional 200 hours. Thus, we obtained samples which were heat treated for 200 and for 400 hours. Similarly the second set of samples was heated at $1300^\circ C$ for 100 and 200 hours.

After each heat treatment, the samples were ground in a mortar and subjected to XRD analysis in a diffractometer equipped with a copper X-ray tube. During analysis of the data, attention was paid not only to the phases which were present, but also to the absence of certain phases. Mainly two publications were used as guides in the analysis: Powder Diffraction File Search Manual (ref. 10) and Phase Diagrams for Ceramists (ref. 11).

RESULTS

The results obtained in this investigation are shown below. The $2CaO \cdot SiO_2$ and $BaZrO_3$ systems are discussed separately.

$CaO \cdot SiO_2$

Na_2O

There is a ternary equilibrium diagram for the Na_2O - CaO - SiO_2 system (ref. 11), however the zone connecting Na_2O and $2CaO \cdot SiO_2$ is uncharted. At $1100^\circ C$ sodium oxide reacted with larnite. The extent of reaction increased with time. The detected phases were $2CaO \cdot SiO_2$ and $Na_2O \cdot CaO \cdot SiO_2$. After 100 hours at $1300^\circ C$ the observed phases were also $2CaO \cdot SiO_2$ and $Na_2O \cdot CaO \cdot SiO_2$. However, after 200 hours a new unknown phase appeared and the amount of $Na_2O \cdot CaO \cdot SiO_2$ decreased substantially. This indicates that $Na_2O \cdot CaO \cdot SiO_2$ was unstable at this temperature.

Na₂SO₄

The original mixture contained two compounds, namely 2CaO·SiO₂ and Na₂SO₄ (thenardite). After heat treatment at 1100° and 1300° C, thenardite disappeared and the presence of a new phase was observed. Based on previous results (ref. 7) this phase is some other form of sodium sulfate.

K₂O

The existing equilibrium phase diagram in the K₂O-CaO-SiO₂ system is incomplete and does not cover the area connecting K₂O-2CaO·SiO₂. XRD analysis of the sample after 200 hours at 1100° C revealed the presence of 2CaO·SiO₂ and of a few weak lines, that could not be accounted for. The diffraction lines produced by this sample are considerably weaker than those obtained from the unreacted sample. The same can be said about the sample, which was heat treated at 1100° C for 400 hours, except that XRD lines due to 2CaO·SiO₂ were much better defined. Similar results were obtained at 1300°C. No CaO·K₂O·SiO₂ or KOH were detected. Either the K₂O did not react with 2CaO·SiO₂ and was lost by evaporation or a glassy phase formed, which could not be detected by XRD.

K₂SO₄

The XRD data obtained indicated that, at 1100° C, K₂SO₄ did not react with 2CaO·SiO₂. After heat treatment at 1300° C for 100 hours, the detected phases were 2CaO·SiO₂, K₂SO₄ and an unknown compound. Continued heat treatment reduced the amount of K₂SO₄. Because the intensities of diffraction lines produced by 2CaO·SiO₂ were not affected by the heat treatments, one can conclude that there was no reaction between K₂SO₄ and 2CaO·SiO₂. The observed unknown phase was probably some form of K₂SO₄.

BaO

According to the existing equilibrium phase diagram for BaO-CaO-SiO₂ system (ref. 11), barium oxide should react with larnite by forming barium silicate and calcium oxide. At both temperatures (1100° and 1300° C), the reaction was complete as no larnite XRD lines were detected. The predominant phase was a compound, the lines of which could be indexed in a manner similar to (Ba_{1.55}Ca_{0.45})·SiO₄. It is reasonable to assume that this compound represents compounds with the general formula 2(Ca_xBa_{1-x})·SiO₂. The few unindexed lines were weak and could not be related to 2BaO·SiO₂, CaO, etc.

BaSO₄

No reaction between 2CaO·SiO₂ and BaSO₄ was observed.

MgO

According to the existing equilibrium diagram for the CaO-MgO-SiO₂ system, MgO should react with 2CaO·SiO₂ to form certain amounts of 3CaO·MgO·SiO₂ (merwinite). The phases observed after heat treatment at 1100° C were MgO,

$2\text{CaO} \cdot \text{SiO}_2$ and an unknown compound, isomorphous with $(2\text{CaO} \cdot \text{SiO}_2)_{5.6} (3\text{CaO} \cdot \text{MgO} \cdot 2\text{SiO}_2)_{4.4}$ (ref. 10). The heat treatment at 1300° caused disappearance of $2\text{CaO} \cdot \text{SiO}_2$; the remaining phases being the unknown compound and MgO .

NiO

Nickel oxide did not react with larnite at 1100° nor at 1300° C. This observation is in agreement with the tentative CaO-NiO-SiO_2 equilibrium diagram (ref. 11).

CoO

The ternary CaO-CoO-SiO_2 equilibrium diagram is not available. Very little reaction occurred at 1100° C and only a trace of an unknown phase was detected by x-ray. The main phases were $2\text{CaO} \cdot \text{SiO}_2$ and CoO . At 1300° C the reaction advanced to the point where the predominant phases were CoO and an unknown compound. The strongest XRD-lines of larnite were only detected as a weak line. Thus, it can be stated that CoO reacted with $2\text{CaO} \cdot \text{SiO}_2$.

ZnO

An equilibrium diagram for the ZnO-CaO-SiO_2 systems exists (ref. 11). In agreement with the diagram, the experimental data indicated that ZnO did not react with larnite at 1100° nor 1300° C. The samples, heat treated at both temperatures, produced well defined XRD patterns of $2\text{CaO} \cdot \text{SiO}_2$ and ZnO .

Fe_2O_3

At 1100° C no reaction was detected between larnite and Fe_2O_3 (hematite). After heat treatment at 1300° C, the detected phases were larnite, hematite and an unknown compound. According to the existing equilibrium diagram (ref. 11), no reaction should take place between these two compounds.

Al_2O_3

At 1100° and 1300° C, alumina reacted completely with larnite. No free alumina was observed. The detected phases were $2\text{CaO} \cdot \text{Al}_2\text{O}_3 \cdot \text{SiO}_2$ and $2\text{CaO} \cdot \text{SiO}_2$ which is in agreement with the existing equilibrium phase diagram (ref. 11).

Cr_2O_3

At 1100° C, Cr_2O_3 reacted with larnite to give $3\text{CaO} \cdot \text{Cr}_2\text{O}_3 \cdot 3\text{SiO}_2$ (uvarovite). No Cr_2O_3 was detected. However, at 1300° C no uvarovite was detected. Only the original compounds, $2\text{CaO} \cdot \text{SiO}_2$ and Cr_2O_3 were observed. This is consistent with the equilibrium diagram (ref. 11). If the experiment were performed at 1300° C only, one could draw a logical conclusion that Cr_2O_3 did not react with larnite. However, the data obtained at 1100° C suggest that during the heat-up period to 1300° C, Cr_2O_3 reacted

with $2\text{CaO} \cdot \text{SiO}_2$ to form uvarovite which later decomposed at the higher temperature into the two original compounds.

P₂O₅

According to the existing equilibrium diagram (ref. 11) the reaction products should have been $3\text{CaO} \cdot \text{P}_2\text{O}_5$, $\text{CaO} \cdot \text{SiO}_2$ and SiO_2 (α -cristobalite). However, after heat treatment at 1100°C , the diffraction lines of one or two unknown compounds were detected. The reaction at 1300°C produced $3\text{CaO} \cdot \text{P}_2\text{O}_5$ (calcium orthophosphate) and an unknown compound with an XRD pattern different from the one observed at 1100°C . It was difficult to establish the presence or absence of α -cristobalite because its diffraction lines were coincident with the lines of the unknown compound or compounds.

V₂O₅

Experiments at 1100°C revealed that V_2O_5 (vanadium pentoxide) reacted with larnite to form an unknown compound. Some unreacted V_2O_5 was also found to be present. No larnite was detected. During experiments at 1300°C , the sample crept out of the platinum container and consequently no analysis was performed. Thus, it is reasonable to assume that V_2O_5 reacted at 1300°C with $2\text{CaO} \cdot \text{SiO}_2$.

BaZrO₃

Na₂O

Apparently there was no reaction between Na_2O and BaZrO_3 . XRD patterns obtained from the samples heat treated at 1100° and 1300°C revealed strong, well defined lines of BaZrO_3 and a few weak lines of an unknown phase. No Na_2O , NaOH or Na_2ZrO_3 were detected. Apparently most of Na_2O was lost by evaporation.

Na₂SO₄

At both temperatures, 1100° and 1300°C , no reaction was observed. The samples gave a very strong BaZrO_3 pattern and some weak lines which did not correspond to Na_2SO_4 or any other known form of sodium sulfate. However, based on previous results (ref. 7), these lines can be attributed to an unindexed form of sodium sulfate.

K₂O

K_2O did not react with BaZrO_3 at 1100° or 1300°C . No K_2O was detected. The XRD pattern of BaZrO_3 remained unchanged. It is reasonable to assume that K_2O was lost by evaporation.

K₂SO₄

As with Na_2SO_4 , BaZrO_3 did not react with K_2SO_4 . After heat treatments at 1100° and 1300°C , the observed phases were BaZrO_3 and some

K_2SO_4 . It is of interest to point out that unlike Na_2SO_4 , K_2SO_4 did not form any complex potassium sulfate.

MgO

MgO did not react with $BaZrO_3$.

CaO

No reaction was observed between CaO and $BaZrO_3$. Obviously, barium zirconate must be a more stable compound than calcium zirconate.

NiO

NiO did not react with $BaZrO_3$ at 1100° or at 1300° C. The XRD patterns were rather deceptive because all NiO diffraction lines (except (311)) coincided with those of $BaZrO_3$.

CoO

CoO did not react with $BaZrO_3$.

ZnO

No reaction was observed between ZnO and $BaZrO_3$.

Fe₂O₃

Analysis of the diffraction patterns of the samples reacted at 1100° and 1300° C revealed that Fe_2O_3 reacted with $BaZrO_3$. The detected phases were $BaZrO_3$, $BaO \cdot 6Fe_2O_3$ and monoclinic ZrO_2 (small amount). In addition the samples became black and magnetic. The black color and the magnetic property should be attributed to $BaO \cdot 6Fe_2O_3$ as $BaZrO_3$ and ZrO_2 have a light color and are not magnetic.

Al₂O₃

The obtained data indicated that Al_2O_3 readily reacted with $BaZrO_3$ at 1100° and 1300° C to form $BaO \cdot Al_2O_3$. In addition to the above compound, the heat treated sample contained $BaZrO_3$ and monoclinic ZrO_2 . No Al_2O_3 was detected. (However, in the presence of compounds containing heavy elements like Ba or Zr, small amounts of Al_2O_3 would not be detected.)

Cr₂O₃

At 1100° and 1300° C, Cr_2O_3 reacted with $BaZrO_3$ to form $BaCrO_4$. In this reaction, chromium changed its valency from 3 to 6. In addition to $BaCrO_4$, monoclinic ZrO_2 was detected. No $BaZrO_3$ or Cr_2O_3 were observed.

SiO₂

SiO₂ reacted with BaZrO₃ at 1100° and 1300° C. In accordance with the existing BaO-ZrO₂-SiO₂ equilibrium phase diagram (ref. 11) the detected phases were 2BaO·2ZrO₂·3SiO₂ and BaZrO₃. It appears that the samples heat treated at 1100° C might also contain a small amount of unreacted silica (α-cristobalite).

P₂O₅

At both temperatures, 1100° and 1300° C, P₂O₅ reacted with BaZrO₃ to form BaO·ZrO₂·P₂O₅. No BaZrO₃ was detected. There were a few XRD lines, some of them relatively strong, that could not be identified.

V₂O₅

V₂O₅ reacted readily with BaZrO₃ at 1100° and 1300° C. Even after only 200 hours at 1100° C, all BaZrO₃ and V₂O₅ were consumed. The observed phases were 3BaO·V₂O₅, monoclinic ZrO₂ and an unknown compound.

DISCUSSION

The results obtained in this investigation are summarized in tables 1 and 2. These tables list all the chemical compounds used and the products of their reactions with calcium silicate and barium zirconate at 1100° and 1300° C. They also include columns marked with the letters "N" or "Y" indicating that essentially no reaction took place (N) or that, yes, there was a partial or complete reaction (Y). The entry "unknown phase" was used when some lines of an XRD pattern could not be attributed to any compound listed in the Powder Diffraction File Search Manual (ref. 10). In general the heat treatments at 1100° and 1300° C produced similar results. When reactions were observed, they were usually the same at both temperatures. If there was no reaction at 1100°, there was generally none at 1300° C. It is noteworthy that no monovalent or divalent oxides and sulfates reacted with barium zirconate. Similarly, calcium orthosilicate was not affected by sulfates, however, it was attacked by sodium, barium and cobalt oxides. Vanadium and phosphorous are impurities generally contained in industrial fuels and their pentoxides reacted readily with both barium zirconate and calcium orthosilicate.

Al₂O₃ and Cr₂O₃, which are oxides of the component elements of the bond coat, reacted with both materials. This indicates that at very high oxide/bond coat interface temperatures, calcium orthosilicate and barium zirconate might not be compatible with MCrAlY type bond coat oxidation products.

In order to compare the chemical stability of calcium orthosilicate and barium zirconate with yttria-stabilized zirconia under the same conditions, table 3 was prepared. It shows how the three thermal barrier materials behaved in the presence of the same impurities when exposed at 1300° C for 200 hours. Because some of the reaction experiments were not performed, the information necessary to complete this table was obtained from reference 11. It can be seen

that 10 out of 17 impurities reacted or would have reacted with calcium orthosilicate and $\text{ZrO}_2\text{-8w/oY}_2\text{O}_3$ and 7 out of 17 reacted or would have reacted with barium zirconate. The impurities that reacted with all three materials were BaO , SiO_2 , P_2O_5 and V_2O_5 , whereas alkali metal sulfates did not react with any of them. The information obtained from this investigation should be of interest in the analysis and solution of problems encountered during the development and testing of thermal barrier coatings.

SUMMARY OF RESULTS

The chemical stability of calcium orthosilicate and barium zirconate were studied at 1100° and 1300° C in the presence of some oxides and sulfates for times to 400 and 200 hours, respectively. These oxides and sulfates represent some of the potential impurities that may be found in gas turbine combustion gases or that may be formed as oxidation products of the elements of bond coat alloys.

The impurities that reacted with $2\text{CaO}\cdot\text{SiO}_2$ are Na_2O , BaO , MgO , CoO , Al_2O_3 , Cr_2O_3 , P_2O_5 and V_2O_5 .

The impurities that did not react with $2\text{CaO}\cdot\text{SiO}_2$ are Na_2SO_4 , K_2O , K_2SO_4 , BaSO_4 , NiO , ZnO and Fe_2O_3 .

The impurities that reacted with BaZrO_3 are Al_2O_3 , Fe_2O_3 , Cr_2O_3 , SiO_2 , P_2O_5 and V_2O_5 .

The impurities that did not react with BaZrO_3 are Na_2O , Na_2SO_4 , K_2O , K_2SO_4 , MgO , CaO , CoO and ZnO .

As a result of this study and a previous study of reactions of potential impurities with $\text{ZrO}_2\text{ 8w/oY}_2\text{O}_3$ (7) it was noted that BaO , SiO_2 , P_2O_5 and V_2O_5 react with all three materials after 200 hours at 1300° C and that alkali metal sulfates do not react.

REFERENCES

1. Stecura, Stephan: Two-Layer Thermal Barrier Coating for Turbine Airfoil - Furnace and Burner Rig Test Results. NASA TM X-3425, 1976.
2. Liebert, Curt H.; et al.: Durability of Zirconia Thermal-Barrier Ceramic Coatings on Air-Cooled Turbine Blades in Cyclic Jet Engine Operation. NASA TM X-3410, 1976.
3. Hjelm, Lawrence N.; and Bornhorst, Bernard R.: Development of Improved Ceramic Coatings to Increase the Life of XLR99 Thrust Chamber. Research-Airplane-Committee Report on Conference on the Progress of the X-15 Project, NASA TM X-57072, 1961, pp. 227-253.

4. Curren, Arthur N.; Grisaffe, Salvatore J.; and Wycoff, Kurt C.: Hydrogen Plasma Tests of Some Insulating Coating Systems for the Nuclear Rocket Thrust Chamber. NASA TM X-2461, 1972.
5. Liebert, Curt H.; and Stepka, Francis S.: Potential Use of Ceramic Coating as a Thermal Insulation on Cooled Turbine Hardware. NASA TM X-3352, 1976.
6. Nijpjes, J. M.: ZrO₂ - Coatings on Nimonic Alloys. High Temperature Materials, Plansee Seminar, 6th, F. Benesovsky, ed., Springer-Verlag, New York 1969, pp. 481-499.
7. Zaplatynsky, Isidor: Reactions of Yttria-Stabilized Zirconia with Oxides and Sulfates of Various Elements. DOE/NASA/2593-78/1, NASA TM-78942, 1978.
8. Hodge, Philip E.; et al.: Thermal Barrier Coatings: Burner Rig Hot Corrosion Test Results. DOE/NASA/2593-78/3, NASA TM-79005, 1978.
9. Miller, Robert E.: Analysis of the Response of a Thermal Barrier Coating to Sodium- and Vanadium-Doped Combustion Gases. DOE/NASA/2593-79/7. NASA TM-79205, 1979.
10. Powder Diffraction File Search Manual. Alphabetical Listing and Search Section of Frequently Encountered Phases (Inorganic), Publication SMA-26. Joint Committee on Powder Diffraction Standards, 1978.
11. Levin, E. M.; and McMurdie, H. F.: Phase Diagrams for Ceramists. (1969, 1975 Supplements). The American Ceramic Society, 1964.

TABLE I. - SUMMARY OF REACTIONS BETWEEN CALCIUM ORTHOSILICATE AND
OXIDES AND SULFATES OF VARIOUS ELEMENTS
(Y - REACTION WAS DETECTED; N - NO REACTION WAS OBSERVED)

Temperature	1100° C				1300° C			
Time	200 hr		400 hr		100 hr		200 hr	
Na ₂ O	2CaO·SiO ₂ Na ₂ O·CaO·SiO ₂	Y	2CaO·SiO ₂ Na ₂ O·CaO·SiO ₂	Y	2CaO·SiO ₂ Na ₂ O·CaO·SiO ₂	Y	2CaO·SiO ₂ Unknown phase Na ₂ O·CaO·SiO ₂ (trace)	Y
Na ₂ SO ₄	2CaO·SiO ₂ Unknown phase	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ Unknown phase	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ Unknown phase	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ Unknown phase	N
K ₂ O	2CaO·SiO ₂	N	2CaO·SiO ₂	N	2CaO·SiO ₂	N	2CaO·SiO ₂	N
K ₂ SO ₄	2CaO·SiO ₂ K ₂ SO ₄	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ K ₂ SO ₄	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ K ₂ SO ₄ Unknown phase	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ unknown phase K ₂ SO ₄ (trace)	N
BaO	2(Ca _x Ba _{1-x})SiO ₄ CaO?	Y	2(Ca _x Ba _{1-x})SiO ₂ CaO?	Y	2(Ca _x Ba _{1-x})·SiO ₂ CaO?	Y	2(Ca _x Ba _{1-x})·SiO ₂ CaO?	Y
BaSO ₄	2CaO·SiO ₂ BaSO ₄	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ BaSO ₄	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ BaSO ₄	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ BaSO ₄	N
MgO	MgO 2CaO·SiO ₂	Y	MgO 2CaO·SiO ₂	Y	MgO Unknown phase	Y	MgO Unknown phase	Y
NiO	2CaO·SiO ₂ NiO	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ NiO	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ NiO	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ NiO	N
CoO	CoO 2CaO·SiO ₂ Unknown phase (trace)	Y	CoO 2CaO·SiO ₂ Unknown phase (trace)	Y	CoO Unknown phase 2CaO·SiO ₂ (trace)	Y	CoO Unknown phase 2CaO·SiO ₂ (trace)	Y
ZnO	2CaO·SiO ₂ ZnO	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ ZnO	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ ZnO	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ ZnO	N
Fe ₂ O ₃	2CaO·SiO ₂ Fe ₂ O ₃	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ Fe ₂ O ₃	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ Fe ₂ O ₃ Unknown phase	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ Fe ₂ O ₃ Unknown phase	N
Al ₂ O ₃	2CaO·Al ₂ O ₃ ·SiO ₂ 2CaO·SiO ₂	Y	2CaO·Al ₂ O ₃ ·SiO ₂ 2CaO·SiO ₂	Y	2CaO·Al ₂ O ₃ ·SiO ₂ 2CaO·SiO ₂	Y	2CaO·Al ₂ O ₃ ·SiO ₂ 2CaO·SiO ₂	Y
Cr ₂ O ₃	3CaO·Cr ₂ O ₃ ·SiO ₂ 2CaO·SiO ₂	Y	3CaO·Cr ₂ O ₃ ·SiO ₂ 2CaO·SiO ₂	Y	2CaO·SiO ₂ Cr ₂ O ₃	Y	2CaO·SiO ₂ Cr ₂ O ₃	Y
P ₂ O ₅	One or two unknown phases	Y	One or two unknown phases	Y	3CaO·P ₂ O ₅ unknown phase SiO?	Y	3CaO·P ₂ O ₅ unknown phase SiO?	Y
V ₂ O ₅	Unknown phase some V ₂ O ₅	Y	Unknown phase trace of V ₂ O ₅	Y	Sample lost	Y	Sample lost	Y

TABLE 2. - SUMMARY OF REACTIONS BETWEEN BARIUM ZIRCONATE
AND OXIDES AND SULFATE OF VARIOUS ELEMENTS

(Y - REACTION WAS DETECTED; N - NO REACTION WAS OBSERVED)

Temperature	1100° C				1300° C			
Time	200 hr		400 hr		100 hr		200 hr	
Na ₂ O	BaZrO ₃ unknown phase	N	BaZrO ₃ unknown phase	N	BaZrO ₃ unknown phase	N	BaZrO ₃ unknown phase	N
Na ₂ SO ₄	BaZrO ₃ unknown phase	N	BaZrO ₃ unknown phase	N	BaZrO ₃ unknown phase	N	BaZrO ₃ unknown phase	N
K ₂ O	BaZrO ₃	N	BaZrO ₃	N	BaZrO ₃	N	BaZrO ₃	N
K ₂ SO ₄	BaZrO ₃ K ₂ SO ₄ (trace)	N	BaZrO ₃ K ₂ SO ₄ (trace)	N	BaZrO ₃ K ₂ SO ₄ (trace)	N	BaZrO ₃ K ₂ SO ₄ (trace)	N
MgO	BaZrO ₃ MgO	N	BaZrO ₃ MgO	N	BaZrO ₃ MgO	N	BaZrO ₃ MgO	N
CaO	BaZrO ₃ CaO	N	BaZrO ₃ CaO	N	BaZrO ₃ CaO	N	BaZrO ₃ CaO	N
NiO	BaZrO ₃ NiO	N	BaZrO ₃ NiO	N	BaZrO ₃ NiO	N	BaZrO ₃ NiO	N
CoO	BaZrO ₃ CoO	N	BaZrO ₃ CoO	N	BaZrO ₃ CoO	N	BaZrO ₃ CoO	N
ZnO	BaZrO ₃ ZnO	N	BaZrO ₃ ZnO	N	BaZrO ₃ ZnO	N	BaZrO ₃ ZnO	N
Fe ₂ O ₃	BaZrO ₃ BaO·6Fe ₂ O ₃ ZrO ₂ (mon)	Y	BaZrO ₃ BaO·6Fe ₂ O ₃ ZrO ₂ (mon)	Y	BaZrO ₃ BaO·6Fe ₂ O ₃ ZrO ₂ (mon)	Y	BaZrO ₃ BaO·6Fe ₂ O ₃ ZrO ₂ (mon)	Y
Al ₂ O ₃	BaZrO ₃ BaO·Al ₂ O ₃ ZrO ₂ (mon)	Y	BaZrO ₃ BaO·Al ₂ O ₃ ZrO ₂ (mon)	Y	BaZrO ₃ BaO·Al ₂ O ₃ ZrO ₂ (mon)	Y	BaZrO ₃ BaO·Al ₂ O ₃ ZrO ₂ (mon)	Y
Cr ₂ O ₃	BaCrO ₄ ZrO ₂ (mon) Cr ₂ O ₃ ?	Y	BaCrO ₄ ZrO ₂ (mon) Cr ₂ O ₃ ?	Y	BaCrO ₄ ZrO ₂ (mon) Cr ₂ O ₃ ?	Y	BaCrO ₄ ZrO ₂ (mon) Cr ₂ O ₃ ?	Y
SiO	2BaO·2ZrO ₂ ·3SiO ₂ BaZrO ₃ SiO ₂ (trace)?	Y	2BaO·2ZrO ₂ ·3SiO ₂ BaZrO ₃ SiO ₂ (trace)?	Y	2BaO·2ZrO ₂ ·3SiO ₂ BaZrO ₃	Y	2BaO·2ZrO ₂ ·3SiO ₂ BaZrO ₃	Y
P ₂ O ₅	BaO·ZrO ₂ ·P ₂ O ₅ unknown phase	Y	BaO·ZrO ₂ ·P ₂ O ₅ unknown phase	Y	BaO·ZrO ₂ ·P ₂ O ₅ unknown phase	Y	BaO·ZrO ₂ ·P ₂ O ₅ unknown phase	Y
V ₂ O ₅	3BaO·V ₂ O ₅ ZrO ₂ (mon) unknown phase	Y	3BaO·V ₂ O ₅ ZrO ₂ (mon) unknown phase	Y	3BaO·V ₂ O ₅ ZrO ₂ (mon) unknown phase	Y	3BaO·V ₂ O ₅ ZrO ₂ (mon) unknown phase	Y

TABLE 3. - COMPARISON OF CHEMICAL REACTIONS BETWEEN
ZrO₂ 8w/o Y₂O₃, 2CaO·SiO₂, BaZrO₃ AND OXIDES AND
SULFATES OF VARIOUS ELEMENTS AFTER 200 hr AT 1300° C
(Y - REACTION WAS DETECTED, N - NO REACTION WAS OBSERVED)

	ZrO ₂ -8w/o Y ₂ O ₃		2CaO·SiO ₂		BaZrO ₃	
Na ₂ O	ZrO ₂ cubic Na ₂ ZrO ₃	Y	2CaO·SiO ₂ unknown phase Na ₂ O·CaO·SiO ₂ (trace)	Y	BaZrO ₃ unknown phase	N
Na ₂ SO ₄	ZrO ₂ cubic ZrO ₂ monoclinic unknown phase	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ unknown phase	N	BaZrO ₃ unknown phase	N
K ₂ O	ZrO ₂ cubic ¹ ZrO ₂ monoclinic	Y	2CaO·SiO ₂	N	BaZrO ₃	N
K ₂ SO ₄	ZrO ₂ cubic ZrO ₂ monoclinic unknown phase	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ unknown phase K ₂ SO ₄ (trace)	N	BaZrO ₃ K ₂ SO ₄ (trace)	N
BaO	BaZrO ₃	Y	2(Ca _x Ba _{1-x}) SiO ₂ CaO	Y	Not tested ²	Y
BaSO ₄	Not tested ³	Y	2CaO·SiO ₂ BaSO ₄	N	Not tested	N
MgO	ZrO ₂ cubic ⁴ ZrO ₂ mon MgO	N	MgO unknown phase	Y	BaZrO ₃ MgO	N
CaO	CaZrO ₃	Y	Not tested ⁵	Y	BaZrO ₃ CaO	N
NiO	ZrO ₂ cubic ZrO ₂ mon NiO	N	2CaO SiO ₂ NiO	N	BaZrO ₃ NiO	N
CoO	Not tested ⁶	Y	CoO unknown phase 2CaO·SiO ₂ (trace)	Y	BaZrO ₃ CoO	N
ZnO	ZrO ₂ cubic unknown phase	Y	2CaO·SiO ₂ ZnO	N	BaZrO ₃ ZnO	N
Fe ₂ O ₃	ZrO ₂ cubic ZrO ₂ mon Fe ₂ O ₃	N	2CaO SiO ₂ Fe ₂ O ₃ unknown phase	N	BaZrO ₃ BaO·6Fe ₂ O ₃ ZrO ₂ (mon)	Y
Al ₂ O ₃	ZrO ₂ cubic ZrO ₂ mon Al ₂ O ₃	N	2CaO·Al ₂ O ₃ ·SiO ₂ 2CaO SiO ₂	Y	BaZrO ₃ BaO·Al ₂ O ₃ ZrO mon	Y
Cr ₂ O ₃	ZrO ₂ cubic ZrO ₂ mon Cr ₂ O ₃	N	2CaO·SiO ₂ ⁷ Cr ₂ O ₃	Y	BaCrO ₄ ZrO ₂ mon Cr ₂ O ₂	Y
SiO ₂	ZrO ₂ cubic ZrO ₂ mon SiO ₂ ZrSiO ₄	Y	Not tested ⁸	Y	2BaO·2ZrO ₂ 3SiO ₂ BaZrO ₃	
P ₂ O ₅	ZrO ₂ mon ZrO ₂ cubic ZrP ₂ O ₃ (ZrO) ₂ P ₂ O ₇	Y	3CaO P ₂ O ₅ unknown phase SiO ₂	Y	BaO·ZrO ₂ P ₂ O ₅ unknown phase	Y
V ₂ O ₅	ZrO ₂ mon V ₂ O ₅ unknown phase	Y	Sample lost ⁹	Y	3BaO·V ₂ O ₅ ZrO ₂ (mon) unknown phase	

¹See reference 7.

²According to reference 11 a reaction should occur to form 2BaO·ZrO₂.

³Reference 7 indicates that BaSO₄ reacted easily at 1400° C. Therefore, it is reasonable to assume that some reaction would also take place at 1300° C.

⁴See reference 7.

⁵According to reference 11 a reaction should occur to form CaO SiO₂.

⁶According to reference 7, reaction occurred at 1400° C. It is reasonable to assume that reaction would take place at 1300° C, also.

⁷Reaction occurred at 1100° C. It suggests that during the heat up period, Cr₂O₃ reacted to form uvarovite (3CaO·Cr₂O₃·SiO₂) which later decomposed at a higher temperature.

⁸According to reference 11, a reaction should occur to form CaO·SiO₂.

⁹Reaction occurred at 1100° C. It is reasonable to assume that reaction take place also at 1300° C.

1 Report No NASA TM-79272		2 Government Accession No		3 Recipient's Catalog No	
4 Title and Subtitle REACTION OF CALCIUM ORTHOSILICATE AND BARIUM ZIRCONATE WITH OXIDES AND SULFATES OF VARIOUS ELEMENTS				5 Report Date October 1979	
				6 Performing Organization Code	
7 Author(s) Isidor Zaplatynsky				8 Performing Organization Report No E-192	
9 Performing Organization Name and Address National Aeronautics and Space Administration Lewis Research Center Cleveland, Ohio 44135				10 Work Unit No	
				11 Contract or Grant No	
12 Sponsoring Agency Name and Address U.S. Department of Energy Fossil Fuel Utilization Division Washington, D.C. 20545				13 Type of Report and Period Covered Technical Memorandum	
				14 Sponsoring Agency Code Report No. DOE/NASA/2593-79/9	
15 Supplementary Notes Final report. Prepared under Interagency Agreement EF-77-A-01-2593.					
16 Abstract Calcium orthosilicate and barium zirconate are being evaluated as the insulation layer of thermal barrier coatings for air-cooled gas turbine components. Their reactions with various oxides and sulfates were studied at 1100 ⁰ and 1300 ⁰ C for times to 400 and 200 hours, respectively. These oxides and sulfates represent potential impurities or additives in gas turbine fuels and in turbine combustion air as well as elements of potential bond coat alloys. The phase compositions of the reaction products were determined by X-ray diffraction analysis. BaZrO ₃ and 2CaO·SiO ₂ both reacted with P ₂ O ₅ , V ₂ O ₅ , Cr ₂ O ₃ , Al ₂ O ₃ , and SiO ₂ . In addition, 2CaO·SiO ₂ reacted with Na ₂ O, BaO, MgO, and CoO and BaZrO ₃ reacted with Fe ₂ O ₃ .					
17 Key Words (Suggested by Author(s)) Thermal barriers Ceramics Reactions of oxides			18 Distribution Statement Unclassified - unlimited STAR Category 27 DOE Category UC-25		
19 Security Classif (of this report) Unclassified		20 Security Classif (of this page) Unclassified		22 Price*	

End of Document